# "Fluoridating the Water Supply"

The endorsement was overwhelming. By a five-to one vote on October 25, 1951, the San Diego City Council approved the addition of fluoride to the city water supply. San Diego would soon join hundreds of American communities that treated its water to improve the dental health of its citizens.

Only six years earlier the first fluoridation of community drinking water in the United States had begun in Grand Rapids, Michigan. Over the next several years health researchers monitored thousands of school children and found that cavity rates dropped dramatically. Simply adding small amounts of fluoride to drinking water, the researchers decided, could make tooth decay preventable.

In San Diego, the Water Department prepared to add one-half of one part of fluoride to every one million parts of water. For an annual cost of about \$17,000, the chemical would be introduced at the city's water filtration plants at Lower Otay, Torrey Pines, and Alvarado.

But for an issue that met little argument at first, fluoridation would soon generate fierce controversy. Opposition to the city's plan began to grow soon after the council vote. Councilman Franklin F. Swan, the sole dissenter to the council's action, wondered loudly if the chemical hurt other parts of the body. Organized opposition came from Christian Scientists who declared fluoridation was forced medication.

The most significant resistance came in a court petition filed by Constantine Leon De Aryan, the controversial publisher of a monthly newspaper called *The Broom*. De Aryan complained that mass fluoridation was "an invasion of the privacy of the home through a public utility." Is the individual "master of his person," De Aryan asked, or "a ward of the city council?"

Superior Court judge Dean Sherry answered De Aryan's petition by issuing a temporary restraining order to prevent the city from starting the fluoridation process. Judge Sherry lifted the order four months later, and then set aside Aryan's suit in August 1952. The publisher persisted but his campaign finally ended when the State Supreme Court refused to review the case.

After nearly thirteen months of delays, treated water began flowing through city mains to water users on November 10, 1952. (Days earlier, several people had complained that fluoridated water was having a "bad effect" on them. Dr. J. B. Askew, the city's Director of Public Health, reminded them that the program had not yet started but promised that once underway, the water would have no odor or taste, or any other ill effects.)

Fluoridation ran smoothly into the spring of 1953. But in June councilman Chester E. Schneider complained about the program's cost. If fluoridation was useful only for prevention of tooth decay among children up to age 12, Schneider asked, wasn't the program too expensive for a comparatively small population?

It was a question that Dr. Askew was happy to answer. The Health Director noted that the annual expense of fluoridation for 443,000 residents was about four cents per person. He added: "if you

assume that only children benefit from fluoridation and that only a fourth to a fifth of the population is made up of children, the cost per child is between 17 and 20 cents a year." "I will leave it up to the parent to compare that to the cost of a child's dental care."

After the failure of De Arvan to stop fluoridation, the cause was taken up Dr. J. K. Christie, a San Diego chiropractor. Christie collected nearly 20,000 petitions to place a ballot measure in the State primary election, scheduled for June 8, 1954. Proposition A would create an ordinance that prohibited the addition of fluoride to city water. The ballot language called fluoridation "a dangerous experiment" on a "captive population."

In the vigorous campaign that followed, local political leaders, health care professionals, educators and businessmen, all seemed to unite to defeat Proposition A. But the community was divided and confused. Even local dentists disagreed. Representing the Citizens Pure Water Committee, Dr. John E. Waters of Coronado argued: "Fluoride can cause bone damage, interfere with digestion and coagulation of the blood." Dr. Lloyd Cottingham of the Citizens Committee for Children's Dental Health countered: "No case has been found of deleterious effect on health from use of fluoridation water."

## At the Sign of THE UNHOLY THREE



Are you willing to PUT IN PAWN to the UNHOLY THREE all of the material, mental and spiritual resources of this GREAT REPUBLIC?

### FLUORIDATED WATER

1—Water containing Fluorine (rat poison—no antidote) is already only water in many of our army camps, making it very casy for obteurs to wipe out an entire camp lersonel. If this haptens, every zen will be at the mercy of the enemy—already within our gates. POLIO SERUM

2—Polio Serum, it is reported, has already killed and maimed children; its future effect on minds and bodies cannot be guaged. This vacciné drive is the entering wedge for nation-wide socialized medi-cine, by the U.S. Public Health Service, (heavily infiltrated by Rus-sian-born doctors, according to Congressman Clare Hoffman.) In enemy hands it can destroy a whole generation.

#### MENTAL HYGIENE

-Mental Hygiene is a subtle and diabolical plan of the enemy insform a free and intelligent people into a cringing horde of Sumbles. Rabbi Spitz in the American Hebrew, March 1, 1946: "American Jews must come to grips with our contemporary anti Semites; we must fill our insane asylums with anti-Semitic lunatics." FIGHT COMMUNISTIC WORLD GOVERNMENT by destroying THE UNHOLY THREE !!! It is later than you think! KEEP AMERICA COMMITTER Box 3094, Los Angeles 54, Calif. II. W. Courtois, Secy. May 16, 1953

On election day San Diego voters passed Proposition A by a vote of 49,976 to 41,382. Now, by law, fluoridation would end in San Diego. "It is regrettable," mourned Dr. Albert L. Anderson of the Citizen's Committee. "Our children will suffer because of the decision."

Multiple efforts to restore fluoridation came and went in the 1950s and 60s. The question returned to the local ballot in 1969, but once again, voters turned it down.

In 1995, State law mandated fluoridation in California's larger communities, but exempted San Diego until the city acquired funding. A grant 3.9 million from First 5 San Diego in 2008 provided the financial support for new fluoridation systems, which now treat city water after an absence of 57 years.

Originally published as "WAR OVER FLUORIDATED WATER IN SAN DIEGO BEGAN DECADES AGO," by Richard Crawford, in the San Diego Union-Tribune, April 28, 2011.